

ANNEX 3: Sub-Projects Completion Reports

The table below was prepared from the completion and assessment reports submitted by the sub-grantees. For Soqosoqo Vakamarama iTaukei Trust Board (SSV), Fiji and Vanuatu Foresters Association (VFA), Vanuatu which did not submit, the entries in the table were taken from their sub-project assessment reports submitted in August 2019 for the project assessment workshop. In most cases, the reports were summarized.

A. Kingdom of Bhutan

| | | |
|---|--|---|
| Sub-Grantee | Royal Society for Protection of Nature | Tarayana Foundation |
| Sub-Project | Capacity building on REDD+ readiness for forest dependent communities in Buli, Zhemgang District (up-scaled) | Capacity Building for REDD+ in Rural Bhutan (up-scaled) |
| Beneficiaries | Direct beneficiaries were some households in villages, students and members of CFMGs/farmers in Bumthang, Chhukha, Sarpang, Tsirang, Trongsa, Wangduephodrang, Chhukha and Zhemgang districts. Relevant REDD+ stakeholders like the Department of Forest and Parks Services (DoFPS), and the Department of Agriculture (DoA) and their related agencies/offices were involved as participants and/or facilitators. | Initially implemented in some villages/community forest management groups (CFMGs)/farmers in Haa, Lhuentse, Mongar, PemaGatshel, Samtse, Trongsa, and Wangduephodrang districts and up-scaled to Dagana and Tsirang districts. |
| Total Cost | US\$ 143,300.76 | US\$ 90,543.02 |
| Effectiveness Date | 5 th September 2017 | 11 th September 2017 |
| Closing date | 31 August 2020 | 30 th September 2019 |
| Actual closing date | External audit still to be conducted due to COVID-19 | 15 th October 2019 |
| Objective/s | Raise awareness of forest dependent communities on climate change and REDD+ initiatives in Bhutan; Build their technical skills/knowledge on REDD+ and engage them in decision making processes related to REDD+, engage/inform benefit sharing and carbon accounting programs; and Promote climate smart agriculture in Chhukha and Zhemgang districts. | Increase awareness, knowledge and build capacities of forest dependent communities and Tarayana Foundation on climate change and REDD+; and assist and prepare the communities for National REDD+ Strategy implementation in rural Bhutan |
| Project design and implementation arrangement | The current implementation modality with an intermediary organization (Tebtebba) which manages the project at regional level has proven efficient and successful from our experience. At the sub-grantee level, RSPN has proper mechanisms in place for implementation and reporting. | The implementation arrangement was good and were done systematically. However, the requirements in terms of paper works/reports made it a little difficult when working with other stakeholders in the delivery of activities. |

| | | |
|---------------------|---|--|
| <p>Achievements</p> | <p>All the planned activities such as trainings, research and documentation¹ and meetings with beneficiaries, government and other REDD+ stakeholders were implemented per agreed targets in the sub-project results framework.</p> <p>RSPN being the oldest non-profit CSO and pioneer in environment conservation in the country has been truly honored and privileged to implement the REDD+ sub-project whereby the capacity of the staff has been enhanced. Further, the sub-project complemented our past and current climate change program.</p> <p>RSPN up-scaled the sub-project in terms of area, beneficiaries and topics covered. It sensitized students from 14 schools (middle and higher secondary and one college) and CFMGs on climate change including its impacts and REDD+. Such activities have enhanced the understanding of the younger generation and CFMG members and further increased RSPN's visibility and disseminated its programs in the country.</p> <p>Successfully translated the REDD+ benefit sharing mechanism and the forest carbon accounting manual and printed posters in English and national (Dzongkhag) languages which were used during the awareness programs that improved understanding among beneficiaries. For the first time in Bhutan, members of community forest were trained on forest carbon accounting and successfully collected forest carbon stock in two-community forests in Buli, Zhemgang.</p> <p>RSPN takes pride in organizing the first ever forest carbon accounting training of trainers (ToT) which received several interest from forestry officials in six districts under the DoFPS. Those trained contributed to the implementation of the sub-project activities in their respective districts which further strengthened RSPN's partnership with government.</p> | <p>Trainings conducted were on climate change and REDD+, benefit sharing, forest carbon accounting, integrated watershed management, community based forest monitoring and traditional forest management practices such as rotational farming, mixed cropping and no chemical fertilizers. The older generation respected the trees and forest and used to advice younger ones not to destroy these. They believed that if they cut down the trees in and around the watershed area, the water will gradually dry up.</p> <p>Those who attended the awareness raising on benefit sharing & forest carbon accounting developed community forests (CF) boundaries through practical works (drawing their CF area to get a clear idea of the formation of boundary) and learned how to use the GPS and DBH measuring tape to measure the amount of carbon stored in individual trees depending on the size and tree species. Moreover, the participants were also able to identify different tree species.</p> <p>A key achievement was the assessment of 28 CFs in four districts (Dagana, Samtse, Tsirang and Wangduephodrang). This is mandatory every ten years to assess the impacts and outcomes of CF management, sustainable management and utilization of resources, and identify issues and challenges in implementation and recommend corrective measures to optimize benefits. Outputs were: forest monitoring including tree saplings planted, demarcation of boundaries, small nurseries established, own funds generated, progress made on Annual Harvest Limit (AHL), income generation, books and record keeping. All together the participants developed competencies</p> |
|---------------------|---|--|

¹ Documentation of traditional knowledge on natural resource management, livelihoods and farming; baseline study on Buli; and feasibility study on eco-tourism as a non-carbon benefit.

The trainings improved the knowledge of CFMG members on climate change and its impacts, REDD+, benefit sharing and benefits from forests and forest carbon accounting. The sub-project has contributed immensely in disseminating REDD+ readiness information to less privileged sections of people in the communities.

Installation of climate smart vegetable demonstration garden (medium size poly-house/green-house) and drip irrigation facilities with plantation vegetables in Kikhar, Zhemgang and distributed 11 varieties of vegetable seeds and 6 different types of agriculture tools to farmers' groups. Women members were trained on demonstration garden management and raising of nursery seedlings inside the poly-house/green-house. Similar vegetable demonstration garden installed also for the Bayul-Kuenza Organic Farmers Group, Bongo Gewog, Chhukha district and vegetable seeds provided.

Initiated a small RSPN organic vegetable garden within its head office campus (Thimpu) to promote small-scale organic vegetable production amongst RSPN staff.

A local REDD+ group was established in Buli, Zhemgang district.

on these. Some 4 new CFs were formed in Samtse district following government mandated process.

The sub-project carried out a collection of traditional forest management practices of the indigenous communities in Lhop, Rai and Monpa of Samtse and Trongsa Dzongkhags (districts) and produced a report.

An assessment of the initial sub-project was conducted in the capital (Thimpu) with participants from 5 districts. The objectives were to share lessons learned and the experiences and assess the sub-project. The last activity was a multi-stakeholder workshop. The main objective was to share the experiences and lessons learned that could feed into the National REDD+ Programme.

The foundation also took part in the national level stakeholders meeting organized by RSPN and participated by representatives of UN agencies, local governments and communities in July 2018. Tarayana also learned from the experiences of RSPN especially in terms of engaging the youth through the schools.

The analysis of the learning achievements in terms of attitudes, skills and knowledge, showed that some attitudes and skills were very much developed. The training addressed conflict management and analyses too. However, knowledge according to the participants, could have been developed more, specifically on forest carbon accounting with practicum. Nonetheless, more participants after the benefit sharing and carbon accounting training were prepared to take action at local level to actively participate in the development of policy building regarding climate change.

| | | |
|--|--|---|
| | | <p>Since the project was implemented in collaboration with the Department of Forest and Parks Services (DoFPS) under the Ministry of Agriculture and Forests (MoAF), Tarayana was able to establish good working relations and networks with the department and its range of offices in different districts. The DoFPS also benefitted hugely especially through the assessment of 28 community forests.</p> <p>The achievements of CFs will be seen in terms of better forest management, social mobilization, and income generation in rural development at the grass roots level.</p> |
| Gender | <p>RSPN does not have any plan or strategy on gender-specific inclusion because we did not encounter any barriers to women's participation and they were represented in fora both at national and local levels. Bhutan respects equal rights of men and women. Despite that, RSPN still encourages women's participation in all its programs and indeed observed that in many of the community level activities, female participants outnumbered the male. However, there has been initiatives by the national REDD+ office to assess gender barriers for inclusion in REDD+ program for the future.</p> | <p>Increasing participation of women, the poor, and disadvantaged groups has been very important, yet a difficult issue in community forestry. Through this sub-project, it was found that women's engagement in the community forests is negligible and needs special focus to address this gender issue. This is still a concern mainly in the southern Bhutan where 3 beneficiary districts are located because of their traditional gender norms which limit women's engagement in activities outside the home. In the initial phase, the sub-project saw almost equal women participation because most of the project sites were in eastern Bhutan which indicates that women in the eastern part were more active in their locality and surrounding and that the sub-project encouraged their participation in decision making.</p> |
| Key factors that affected implementation | <p>Timely and appropriate technical support received from the national government REDD+ office, district and block administrative offices; RSPN's past intervention in the same beneficiary communities helped achieve project outcomes without much difficulties; RSPN's experiences in past climate change projects also contributed technically in implementing the project; relatively short sub-project implementation period was a major challenge for planning</p> | <p>Community forest is an institutional approach for preserving forest resources while providing rural households access to forest products that benefitted the community in income generation and construction materials. Knowing the benefits of the CFs, there was a maximum participant turn out and moreover, Tarayana was able to collaborate with government such as the WMD,</p> |

| | | |
|---|---|--|
| | <p>and timely completion of activities. RSPN had to outsource some the implementation of some activities with the Department of Forest and Park Services (DoFPS); difficult transportation especially during the monsoon season to project areas was risky and difficult because of the hilly terrain and frequent road blocks due to landslides; limited access to appropriate awareness materials and technical capacity of the sub-grantee; low level of literacy and ageing of some direct beneficiaries affected their understanding; REDD+ includes several technical terms which are difficult to translate to national language (Dzongkhag); and unexpected outbreak of pandemic virus (e.g: Coronavirus) affecting the country and region has hampered the implementation of project activities and transferring its expected benefits to the beneficiaries.</p> | <p>Social Forestry Extension Division, Territorial Field Divisions of Wangduephodrang, Dagana, Tsirang and Samtse under the DoFPS for the implementation of the activities. This collaboration has established a good relationship and there is huge potential for collaboration in the future.</p> <p>Some challenges in implementation were: low level of literacy in the communities, feedback/evaluation forms were difficult to accomplish for large number of participants, short period for sub-project implementation, lack of technical expertise so some activities were outsourced resulting to some activity reports being misplaced, occurrence of natural calamities like continuous rain resulting to landslides blocking access roads, and responding to government reporting requirements which were due during the height of implementation.</p> |
| Recipient's performance | <p>Tebtebba's input during the implementation of project was excellent both technically and administratively; and regional events (trainings and workshop/dialogue) organized under the project were also efficiently managed and very timely. This hugely contributed towards better understanding of the overall REDD+ program.</p> | <p>The recipient organization has been very much supportive and has provided good guidance during project implementation. The prompt responses to any clarification was very impressive. Despite the challenges we faced due to some internal changes at the organization, Tebtebba has been very patient during the difficult time we went through.</p> |
| Grievances/complaints received regarding the project and resolution | <p>RSPN did not receive any form of grievance/complaints either from beneficiary communities or government during the implementation of the sub-project.</p> | <p>An issue was raised by forestry officials in relation to their mandates. They were surprised with the sub-project activities and they felt that we were doing their work but it was clarified.</p> |
| Sub-Project sustainability | <p>Although there is no sustainability mechanism put in place at the moment, the information and capacity building of forest dependent communities has immensely contributed to their understanding and knowledge on the concept of REDD+ which they can share continuously.</p> <p>The capacity building provided by the sub-project to local governments as well as forestry officials has also increased their knowledge towards planning and execution of forest</p> | <p>The leverage of capacity building has been very large, not only in terms of skills and confidence building, but also to garnered additional support for programmes and funding. The activities carried out through the sub-project will be scaled-up through the "Securing ecological connectivity of high conservation value area in Bhutan" project that will be implemented from June 2020 onward with support from WWF Germany. All the</p> |

| | | |
|-----------------|--|---|
| | <p>management programs. The sub-project complemented government's program in disseminating REDD+ information and contributed to capacity building in the national readiness phase. It is considered essential for any country where citizens need to understand the concept before program implementation. The acquired knowledge and skills will come handy in the national REDD+ strategy implementation and will unarguably contribute to better outcomes.</p> <p>RSPN has also institutionalized the local REDD+ group in Buli which could assist in the implementation of future projects/programs.</p> | <p>lessons learned and the experiences from this initiative have been built into the new project that will benefit more villages in eight districts.</p> <p>Also, most of the activities were capacity building which directly benefited individuals enabling them to empower themselves through information, knowledge and skills.</p> |
| Lessons learned | <p>Bringing all relevant stakeholders onboard before the inception of the sub-project was very vital for the success of the project and achievement of outcome/s. Roles and inputs of the implementers were clear and resources required were identified.</p> <p>Have a clear idea/information of seasonal activities of beneficiaries to ensure quality and timely implementation of activities with active participation of beneficiaries at the grassroots level.</p> <p>Implementing activities at village level favors women's participation. This encouraged/enabled increased female participation compared to activities organized outside villages.</p> <p>Efficient feedback mechanism for participants helped evaluate their understanding of the topics discussed during the trainings</p> | <p>Some of the activities required a lot of technical expertise and we had to rely on the DoFPS for these to be completed but it was difficult to confirm the availability of the resource persons which sometimes took a month that hampered timely delivery. Moreover, some of the activities like formation of new community forests (CF) required at the maximum of 10 people and is a lengthy process of around 6-7 months. The CF formation process requires all the steps in the CF manual: application, CF management plan, approval and implementation.</p> <p>Isolated women in leadership approach produce limited result, changing preconceived notions about women to gender inequality can only be done gradually by offering opportunities for marginalized women and girls. There is a need to follow them up to get involved in project activities that promote gender equality and include gender concepts in trainings and other activities.</p> |
| Recommendations | <p>Continue support for capacity building on REDD+ readiness and ERP implementation for: a) CSOs to be able to engage effectively in REDD+ programs, b) local governments on the importance of NRM, and c) rural communities/CFMGs on governance and management of community forests in relation to REDD+ including water resource management;</p> | <p>Create awareness and build capacities of CF facilitators towards social inclusion and CF office bearers on proper management.</p> <p>CSOs to focus on promoting women's participation;</p> |

| | | |
|--|--|---|
| | <p>Strengthen existing inclusion and partnership between forest dependent communities, CSOs and government;</p> <p>Support implementation of REDD+ specific actions in the areas of sustainable natural resource management, clean energy (e.g. wood efficient technology), climate change adaptation and mitigation at community level under non-carbon benefit program;</p> <p>Support enterprise development like eco-tourism and cottage industries in rural communities;</p> <p>Promote nature based enterprises like eco-tourism, PES in community forest;</p> <p>Undertake assessment study on past customary practices on natural resource management;</p> <p>There is an urgent need for contingency plan by the donor and implementing organization to tackle the challenges of implementation of projects and programs during the time of outbreak of natural disasters, epidemic and pandemic virus in the future (restrictions by the Royal Government of Bhutan due to coronavirus pandemic hampered the implementation of current project activities, RSPN requested an extension to ensure project completion)</p> | <p>The reports required for each training was quite substantial to complete in a short period of time. These could be simplified for the effectiveness of the project especially when the project period is very limited. Beneficiary feedback has an important role to play in contributing to development effectiveness, and also increasing the role of citizens in development. A number of donors are using beneficiary feedback mechanisms – such as evaluations, formal discussions and social media – to collect this feedback from beneficiaries. However, this feedback is challenged by language barriers and managing beneficiaries’ expectations, among other limitations.</p> |
|--|--|---|

B. Pacific (Republic of Fiji and Republic of Vanuatu)

| | | | |
|-------------|--|--|--|
| Sub-Grantee | Grace Trifam Ministry (GTM-Fiji) ² | Soqosoqo Vakamarama iTaukei Trust Board (SSV-Fiji) | Vanuatu Foresters’ Association (VFA-Vanuatu) |
| Sub-Project | Capacity building on REDD+ for forest dependent indigenous (iTaukei) peoples in Fiji | Building capacity for Fiji’s forest-dependent indigenous men and women to actively participate in the Fiji REDD+ Readiness Program | Building the capacity of the Vanuatu indigenous forests dependent population to be aware of REDD+ and how they could adjust their socio- |

² The terminal report will be submitted separately

| | | | |
|---------------------|--|--|---|
| | | | economic activities in order to enhance carbon stocks and simultaneously adapt to impacts of climate change. |
| Beneficiaries | Some residents in the villages of Navakawau (Vuna District, Cakaudrove Province), Draubuta (Nikoro, Navosa-Nadroga), Namuavoivoi (Lekutu, Bua), Levuka (Cakaudrove East, Cakaudrove), Naraviravi (Tokaimalo, Ra), and Burelevu (Nalaba, Ra) | Forest owning communities adjacent to the pilot sites of Emalu and Drawa, and within their respective provinces of Nadroga/Navosa and Macuata, and who have indicated an interest elements of the National Emission Reductions Program | Indigenous communities on the five strategic REDD+ islands (Santo, Malakula, Efate, Erromango and Tanna) and also included two other islands (Epi, Aneityum). |
| Total Cost | US\$ 38,282.82 | US\$ 20,708.08 | US\$ 40,314.87 |
| Effectiveness Date | 18 th March 2019 | 20 th June 2017 | 28 th September 2017 |
| Closing Date | 30 th September 2019 | 31 st August 2018 | 31 st August 2018 |
| Actual Closing Date | 4 th August 2020 | 12 th July 2019 | 27 th February 2020 |
| Objective/s | Increase knowledge of iTaukei to fully participate in REDD+ and contribute to national level ERP discussion whenever possible | Build the capacity of forest-dependent indigenous men and women from priority sites for active participation in the National Emissions Reduction Program and the implementation of the National REDD+ Policy and support the National Sustainable Development Plan, and the Green Growth Framework | Enhance knowledge of indigenous groups/local communities on REDD+ and climate change and potential REDD+ activity options; and Strengthen the interaction between indigenous communities and REDD+ decision makers for a stronger voice of indigenous peoples in related decision making |
| Key Achievements | Six awareness trainings on climate change, REDD+ and forest carbon accounting including on site practical exercises; reached 305 total direct beneficiaries (60% women). The women started collecting seeds from the forests and started doing their potting straight away to establish their small nurseries. | Six awareness raising on climate change and REDD+, and a training of trainers on REDD+ and gender with 518 total participants (male-236, female-282). In the awareness raising the resource persons focused on technical issues on environment and climate but failed to pay attention to other issues that causes loss and damage on culture and means of | REDD+ awareness raising trainings in 21 communities – six more than the 15 initially planned for 632 with 471 male and 176 female. Awareness was done in the local language (Bislama) and technical terms were defined in the simplest and most understandable way possible. However, time and |

| | | | |
|--|---|---|---|
| | <p>Another is the translation of the of the forest carbon accounting training manual to iTaukei language.</p> <p>The sub-project created more interests amongst participants to know more about the role of their trees and requested for more thorough practical learning in forest carbon accounting.</p> <p>The trainings have also upgraded the skills and knowledge levels of GTM Field Team.</p> | <p>livelihoods in those communities.</p> <p>A baseline study on their understanding on REDD+ was implemented with the assistance of landowning representative, REDD+ officials, and youths who are directly part of the Landowning Youth groups.</p> <p>The sub-project improved capacity of the organization in terms of technical knowledge, organizational management, networking, information gathering, report writing, research competencies, organization competency, appreciation of cultural practices and norms, improved database, increased positive exposure & enhanced reputation</p> | <p>resources were not available to do follow ups and evaluate impacts of the awareness conducted but from the evaluation forms completed at the end of the workshops the majority of participants indicated that this was the first time a REDD+ and/or climate change awareness was done in their community and that the messages imparted were very simple and clear to understand.</p> <p>Relevant stakeholders were consulted in a workshop for site selection. Relevant technical people in the communities were contacted and some assisted in delivering the awareness messages.</p> |
| Gender | <p>There was an increased involvement of rural women. The sub-project exceeded its 50% target on women's participation by 10%. The prejudiced view that women are always reserved in rural communities was not there. It was found that women were inspired and open to learn, especially in the field work exercise. The achievement in terms of number of women participants is encouraging in a male dominated/paternalistic society. 'Queen Esther Concept' was promoted, meaning women participants were not allowed to do the catering.</p> | <p>Project aimed at surveying men and women living in the forests, however majority of resource persons were women. No part of the project required equal participation of men and women.</p> | <p>We believe that our sub-project contributed to gender equality by way of engaging VFA female members as co-facilitators in the awareness activities and also having some discussions in gender focus groups in the communities.</p> |
| Key factors that affected implementation | <p>GTM had a field team of six officers which implemented the</p> | <p>There was a Project Committee supported by REDD+, Nature Fiji</p> | <p>One of the strengths of VFA is the fact that almost all members</p> |

| | | | |
|--|--|---|---|
| | <p>sub-project headed by the Executive Director in collaboration with the Provincial Offices represented by the District Representatives (mata-ni-tikinas). There was also sporadic assistance from the REDD+ Unit in the Ministry of Forestry (MoF).</p> <p>The unfavorable weather, road conditions, and limited transportation services affected access to and mobility within the communities. Government officials from the Ministry of Forests (MoF) were very helpful. There need to be stronger assistance and logistical assistance from the critical Ministry of iTaukei Affairs despite the strict protocols on holding community activities, the Ministry which looks after the affairs of indigenous communities in Fiji. The youth were staying away from the trainings because they are into commercial cultivation of yaqona under the Rural Millionaire programme of the Ministry of Regional Development which was opposite of REDD+. Simplifying technical terms associated with carbon accounting was also a challenge. However, we overcame these challenges by well pre-engagement by GTM executives and always maintaining connections with District Representatives and Provincial Offices for their support. Any last minute changes were swiftly</p> | <p>MareqetiViti, Live & Learn, Landowners Representatives, Provincial Office, communities and youths</p> <p>Some targets were not met because of inadequate budget to meet logistic requirements like transport, board & lodging, own cost, misjudged number of persons, no opportunity cost, negative weather condition, poor understanding of localities like their terrains, geographical issues of the area, unforeseen circumstances that force life at risk but no insurance provided, unrealistic expectation of the project, unclear terms and conditions on the implementor, non delivery by other stakeholders, unreliable stakeholders, outside interference, selection of personnel, administrative delay, project approach involved talking to them (beneficiaries) on outside concepts/issues/ideas, this is probably due to the technical nature of the subject of discussion leading inability to relate to concepts – differing mindsets</p> | <p>are professionals in the field of forestry and environment hence, implementing REDD+ related projects comes with ease. One of the weaknesses is that the VFA does not have a full time paid staff to administer and manage the project activities and the project work have been done on voluntary bases hence, at times some activities were completed late. Weather limitations compounded by inaccessibility of the communities affected scheduled awareness activity dates in some of the island communities. As such, nothing much could be done but wait for the cyclone/stormy weather to pass.</p> <p>The funds available had limited the message spread to the wider populace in the rural areas.</p> |
|--|--|---|---|

| | | | |
|--|---|---|--|
| | communicated by the GTM executives to the Field Teams on the ground. | | |
| Recipient's performance | Generally, the communication was near perfect and so swift. We learnt a lot from online communication swiftness. Though we had few operational glitches in our finance reporting, Tebtebba was our mentor which we really are forever grateful. It was unfortunate that Tebtebba's field visit did not materialize. | Not very impressive and not enough budget | Tebtebba's support has been great during the implementation of the sub-project however, it is recommended that Tebtebba should understand the limitations in terms of weather restrictions as well as geographical scatterings of the islands. |
| Grievance/complaints received regarding the project and resolution | There was no single complaint. In fact, there were wide commendations for the opportunity they received from the trainings, especially from the women and youth, that they were empowered and inspired to know more about carbon accounting in the future. | Complaints mainly from the organization/sub-grantee | A couple of communities had gotten the REDD+ messages wrong from previous interventions in terms of benefits hence, complained that the program was taking too long to materialize. This message was corrected to the communities concerned. |
| Sub-Project Sustainability | GTM wishes the gains that they achieved will be further utilized to further sharpen their skills in carbon accounting by more funding (either through upscaling of this sub-project) or through Fiji's own REDD+ or even the Fiji ERP implementation funding in the next 5 years. | SSV's current activity includes REDD+, Climate Change, Blue Economy & Feminist Advocacy, Empowering women through promoting entrepreneurs | REDD+ messages have been imparted to 21 communities in the country however, to sustain the messages there is a need for follow up visits to re-inforce the messages. |
| Lessons learned | Women were too open and willing to learn; Proper pre-planning is critical; The Fiji REDD+ Unit need to greatly improve its direct assistance and logistical and moral support to sub-grantees in the future. The REDD+ programme is mandated by the MoF, thus they must at least assist at Divisional | Proper Project management - Gender Equality was not part of the project document | |

| | | | |
|-----------------|--|--|--|
| | levels, where necessary. The communities are rich in natural resources that could be harnessed into alternative livelihoods/enterprises. GTM improved its understanding on the real situation of communities and the specificities of iTaukei that should be addressed in national planning. | | |
| Recommendations | Upscaling of funding for carbon accounting trainings and on-site field excursion in Fiji and for livelihood component (e.g. rocket stove, alternative livelihood/enterprise development); GTM be immediately funded for carbon accounting trainings for Land Owning Units tribal chiefs and their representatives together with faith-based organization leaders; There must be another Asia-Pacific level training of trainers on carbon accounting that has the critical basic GIS mapping and reporting component. | Begin with what the communities want and make sure they should benefit | VFA believes that all communities in the islands need to be enlightened on what climate change is, its causes, and REDD+ as potential remedy hence, efforts should be made to bring such awareness to all. REDD+ is a new concept and more funds should be allocated to reach more rural communities. It was also suggested that practical/hands-on examples of CO2 emission mitigation be included in the awareness to reinforce understanding of the messages. |

C. Socialist Republic of Vietnam

| | | |
|-------------|---|--|
| Sub-Grantee | Hoa Binh Cooperative for Agro-Forestry and Environment ³ | International Center for Tropical Highland Ecosystems Research (ICTHER) ⁴ |
| Sub-Project | Capacity building for ethnic minorities to be ready to actively participate in REDD+ as an independent stakeholder through their legal entities (up-scaled) | Promoting collaborative approach in forest management to reduce carbon emissions among forest dependent households and forest management enterprises in Northern Central Coastal Region of Vietnam (up-scaled ⁰) |

³ A cost extension was not implemented due to COVID-19 related government restrictions

⁴ Consultancy arrangement

| | | |
|---|--|---|
| Beneficiaries | Tay, Nung, Zao, H'Mong, Cao Lan, Muong, San Chi, Thai, Tho Kinh of which around 80% are ethnic minorities in Vo Nhai district, Thai Nguyen province and Nhu Xuan district, Thanh Hoa province | Thai, Muong and Mong ethnic peoples in Trung Ly commune, Muong Lat District, Thanh Hoa province; and Van Kieu ethnic people in Ta Long commune, Dakrong District, Quang Tri province |
| Total Cost | US\$ 78,454.64 | US\$ 184,208.00 |
| Effectiveness Date | 31 st May 2017 | 19 th February 2018 |
| Closing Date | 30 th June 2020 | 30 th September 2019 |
| Actual Closing Date | 4 th July 2020 | 21 st November 2019 |
| Objective/s | <p>Strengthen the knowledge of targeted ethnic minorities and forest-dependent communities on REDD+ Readiness, thereby allowing them to increase their active participation in REDD+ processes at the national and local levels</p> <p>Strengthen knowledge exchange at the local and national levels and promote policy advocacy at provincial and national levels</p> <p>Assist the communities to set-up legal entities (cooperatives) to access to the government policy on forestry as the independent stakeholder.</p> | <p>Empower the local forest-dependent communities via the Forest Management Councils (FMCs) to develop greater stewardship over forest resources that historically they managed but in the state-building process their traditional rights to access, usage and tenure have been changed; and</p> <p>Demonstrate to technical forestry experts in Vietnam that better management of existing forest resources is as much a social as a technical issue and that indigenous knowledge accumulated over more than a millennium will add considerable value to existing knowledge bases on forests in Vietnam.</p> |
| Project design and implementation arrangement | Setting up cooperatives and an alliance of cooperatives, training of trainers, policy advocacy at district levels, and partnership/collaboration with local governments. | Project site selection in Muong Lat District, Thanh Hoa Province and Dakrong District, Quang Tri Province; clarification of issues, determination of people and organizations involved; encouraged village participation and utilization of local resources; meetings with relevant organizations and community leaders; considering knowledge and perception of villagers on several issues; and better collaboration between local government, forest owners and villagers. |
| Achievements | Implemented all planned activities and had meetings with local governments. Trainings on the different groups ⁵ of topics for self governing groups (SGGs) and cooperatives | 17 trainings conducted for 518 (257 female) direct beneficiaries; 6 meetings with government and other stakeholders. These improved knowledge and |

⁵ Group 1 includes topics on citizen's rights; legal owner's rights and duties; legal interest of the natural production forest owners; power and duty of forest rangers and local authority in forest management; climate change and causes; role of natural forest and ecosystem; and what is REDD+?. Group 2 topics: REDD+ framework; Cancun safeguards; result-based payment; benefit sharing; FPIC; grievance mechanism; MRV; drivers of deforestation and forest degradation; and introduction of the FCPF program. Group 3 topics: national and provincial REDD+ policies; opportunities, challenges and solutions for ethnic minorities and women to participate in REDD+; introduction of community-ownership based REDD+ initiative an lessons from a pilot project; and lessons learned in CBMIS in Binh Long commune.

| | | |
|--------|---|---|
| | <p>leaders, training teams and SGG members; leaders were trained also on preparing project proposals, conducting meetings and forest carbon accounting. Trainers (called FPIC teams) were trained among the leaders of cooperatives who assisted in the delivery of training activities.</p> <p>Assisted communities to set-up legal entities (cooperatives) to access government programs on forestry. In Nhu Xuan district, Thanh Hoa province, two new co-operatives⁶ were established which signed a 7-year (2019-2025) forest protection contract over 1,031.93 hectares under the government’s forest protection program. The 8 SGGs under Thanh Trung Cooperative⁷ in Thanh Son Lam commune were issued forest use rights certificates in 2019 covering a total forest area of 1219 hectares.</p> <p>The Nhu Xuan Alliance of Community Forest Owner Cooperatives or NACFO⁸ was established. The members had an MOU to work together to protect 2,884.43 hectares of forest using the “Landscape inter-community customary governance forest management” model.</p> | <p>perception of participants on several issues that could improve both forest management capacity and livelihood conditions.</p> <p>In relation to the Carbon Emissions Reduction (ERP) program, capacity building for villagers on ACMA, BSM, FMC operation and collaborations indicated progress in people’s awareness and capacity that could give valuable lessons and experiences for the coming activities in other areas in the ER-P region in Vietnam.</p> <p>Participation of project team in the Training of Trainers on forest carbon accounting added some human resources for project implementation and in the future as well.</p> <p>Collaboration and networking between local government, forest owners and villagers has been developed.</p> |
| Gender | <p>Dealing with gender inequality takes time due to cultural and economic barriers. The women work very hard and have less time to participate in social work and when they participate in village meetings, they have no voice. To deal with this problem, the project trained trainers/FPIC teams in the communities who conducted meetings/trainings with groups of households/SGGs which women attended and where they are confident to speak. The sub-project also encouraged women to take leadership positions in the co-operatives.</p> | <p>Women joined all activities and participated actively. They proved they could learn and train other villagers. Through participation in meetings and working as members of the FMC, female members are getting more confident and willing to share their ideas/make suggestions. Ethnic minority women improved their voice in forest protection planning to secure their forest use rights and preserve indigenous culture of their communities.</p> |

⁶ Rung Xanh Cooperative in Hoa Quy commune and Quyet Thang Cooperative in Xuan Quy commune with 723 combined household members

⁷ Set-up in 2017 under the FCPF Gender Fund through Tebtebba

⁸ The members include Than Son Lam (Cat Van commune), Thanh Trung (Thanh Lam commune), Rung Xanh (Hoa Quy commune) and Quyet Thang (Xuan Quy commune) cooperatives with a total of 40 self governing groups(SGGs)/community forest owners composed of 3,086 households.

| | | |
|--|---|---|
| <p>Key factors that affected implementation</p> | <p>Support and cooperation of local governments (District and Commune People's Committees), leaders and members of the co-operatives</p> <p>Limited time for implementation; low level of knowledge among community members; poor quality of previous village meetings; and weather disturbances like strong rains and storms.</p> | <p>Leveling-off of expectations with government and communities on the nature and content of the sub-project; support of government at different levels and community in terms of preparations for site visits, organizing trainings and conducting interviews; sufficient budget; and qualified project implementation team</p> <p>Short time for delivery; limited access to information on benefit sharing; poverty of local community in project sites; dispute between forest protection and livelihood improvement; bad weather; location of project sites (bordering area), and availability of transportation</p> |
| <p>Recipient's performance</p> | <p>The sub-grant agreement was clear to the sub-grantee and the target communities; and Tebtebba was supportive and instructions provided were clear.</p> | <p>Responded very quickly and generously to assist the project team; comments and guidance were so practical and useful</p> |
| <p>Grievances/complaints received regarding the project and resolution</p> | <p>There were no complaints received. The co-operatives have their own complaint and resolution system.</p> | <p>There were no complaints received, however, there were questions raised: land use/tenure problems remain one of the main challenges to local forest management organizations; how long will it take before the carbon fund program starts in the sub-project area; and how to help communities to have better access to information</p> |
| <p>Sub-Project sustainability</p> | <p>All beneficiary communities have their legal entities (cooperatives) which can exist for 50 years. These cooperatives have working licenses and capacity to participate in government forest protection programs including in ERP later. The members can earn income from the collection of NTFPs in the forest allocated to them and payments from forest protection contracts.</p> | <p>The outcome of the sub-project shows possible sustainability of gains. Those trained can continue to empower ethnic minorities, indigenous or local communities and poor and forest dependent groups with the support of government from local to national levels. Establishment and development of more of forest management councils/groups with good members can enhance community capacity.</p> |
| <p>Lessons learned</p> | <p>The target beneficiaries are suffering seriously from lack of the knowledge on rights, laws, policies and no dot cooperate/link with each other. Ethnic minorities/local people should have a legal entity and be capacitated on government policies/laws and how to access government programs to be able to benefit from these</p> | <p>Understand IPs' situation including their living, production and market conditions, indigenous knowledge, constraints and needs; introduce the project and level-off on expectations at the beginning of implementation; provide opportunity for local villagers to contribute ideas, make decisions and carry out activities relevant to project objectives; and support of government at different</p> |

| | | |
|-----------------|---|---|
| | | levels and the community, and collaboration among stakeholders is needed. |
| Recommendations | <p>Longer time for implementation and sustained capacity building</p> <p>Government should recognize and respect FPIC and sustainable forest management of ethnic minorities and allocate forest use rights to them as an effective mechanism for forest protection and for them to participate effectively in REDD+ for its success</p> <p>Provide support for the a) establishment and sustained capacity building of legal community institutions and community trainers; b) replication of the 'Inter-community landscape approach and customary governance based forest management' model; and c) implementation of forest laws and policies at ground level with the direct, effective and full involvement of ethnic minorities and local communities.</p> | <p>Conduct consultations with communities during project conceptualization and levelling off of expectations before implementation; provide opportunities for beneficiaries to participate in regional knowledge sharing activities; support replication of the sub-project in other areas in the ERP region and capacity building of sub-grantee organization and forest management groups including technical activities adapted to community situation and existing indigenous knowledge like those in food production; and use project funds to leverage/ mobilize government support especially at community level</p> |